

# THE BAIS HAVAAD HALACHA JOURNAL

Family, Business, and Jewish Life through the Prism of Halacha

VOLUME 5785 • ISSUE IV • PARSHAS CHAYEI SARAH

A PUBLICATION OF THE  
BAIS HAVAAD HALACHA CENTER

290 River Avenue, Lakewood NJ 08701

1.888.485.VAAD (8223)

[www.baishavaad.org](http://www.baishavaad.org)

[info@baishavaad.org](mailto:info@baishavaad.org)

Lakewood • Midwest • Brooklyn • South Florida

לע"נ הרב יוסף ישראל  
ב"ר משה גרוסמן זצ"ל

Dedicated in loving memory of  
HaRav Yosef Grossman zt"l



## MONKEYS ON THE RUN: PEOPLE AND BA'ALEI CHAIM

Adapted from the writings of Dayan Yitzhak Grossman

AP News reports:

Forty-three monkeys escaped from a compound used for medical research in South Carolina.<sup>1</sup>

Most of the monkeys have since been recaptured:

Just eight monkeys remain free from the group who more than a week ago broke out of a South Carolina compound that breeds the primates for medical research, authorities said... They have been lured back with peanut butter and jelly sandwiches and other treats, officials said.<sup>2</sup>

The Gemara tells the story of an animal that sought refuge from an unpleasant fate:

But the sufferings of Rabbi (R' Yehudah Hanasi) came as the result of an event and left as a result of an event.

"They came as the result of an event"—what

was this event? There was once this calf that they were leading to slaughter. It went and hung its head among the folds of Rabbi's garment and it cried. Rabbi told it, "Go; for this you were created." They said (in *Shamayim*), "Since he does not show mercy, let suffering come upon him."

"And they left as a result of an event": One day, Rabbi's maidservant was sweeping the house. There was a litter of baby weasels that had been cast upon the floor, and she was sweeping them up. Rabbi told her, "Leave them be. It is written, 'And His mercy is upon all His creations.'" They said (in *Shamayim*), "Since he shows mercy, let us show mercy to him."<sup>3</sup>

As we have previously noted,<sup>4</sup> the Trumas Hadeshen (R' Yisrael Isserlin) explains that "although it was absolutely permitted to

(continued on page 2)



PARSHAS CHAYEI SARAH

### TIMELY PRAYER

Excerpted and adapted from a *shiur*  
by Dayan Yehoshua Grunwald

And Yitzchak went out to pray in the field  
toward evening...

Bereishis 24:63

According to Chazal (Brachos 26b), this *pasuk* teaches that Yitzchak instituted the practice of davening Mincha. The Gemara records a *machlokess* about the latest time for this *tfilah*: R' Yehudah holds that one must daven before *plag hamincha*—an hour and a quarter before sunset in *sha'os zmaniyos* (variable halachic hours)—while the Chachamim say one may daven until nightfall.

Although the Gemara rules that one may adopt either approach on a consistent basis, the practice of most people is to follow the Chachamim (except on Shabbos, which may be more lenient). But authorities differ about the definition of nightfall in this context. According to Rabeinu Yonah, it means *shkiah* (sunset); according to the Magein Avraham, it means *tzeis hakochavim* (when the stars emerge).

Later *Acharonim* differ about the practical halacha. The Gra (Ma'aseh Rav) and Aruch Hashulchan strongly argue that *shkiah* is the latest time for Mincha. The Divrei Yatziv (the Klausenberger Rebbe) says one may daven Mincha until *tzeis hakochavim*. The Mishnah Brurah rules that one should daven Mincha

(continued on page 2)

<sup>1</sup>Jeffrey Collins, 43 monkeys escape from a South Carolina medical lab. Police say there is no serious danger. AP News, <https://apnews.com/article/monkeys-escape-alpha-genesis-south-carolina-66a78279a7a5e57c58f6a095335936da>.

<sup>2</sup>Only 8 monkeys remain free after more than a week outside a South Carolina compound. AP News, <https://apnews.com/article/monkeys-escape-alpha-genesis-south-carolina-c5ld310166360b7edf4de4401b84b2d>.

<sup>3</sup>Bava Metzia 85a.

<sup>4</sup>Canine Hara: May Animals Be Hurt for Human Benefit? May 16, 2024.

**Q&A** from the  
**BAIS HAVAAD  
HALACHA HOTLINE**  
1.888.485.VAAD(8223)  
[ask@baishavaad.org](mailto:ask@baishavaad.org)

## In Second Place

**Q** If I start eating in my car and wish to continue after I exit it, do I need another *bracha*?

**A** A person who is eating and changes his location (*shinui makom*) is reckoned to have finished eating (except in the case of certain foods; see below). He must make a new *bracha* in order to eat at the new location. The classic example of *shinui makom* is leaving a house (O.C. 178:1).

A new *bracha* is required even if the move was planned at the time of the initial *bracha* (Mishnah Brurah *ibid.* 39). In the case of a minor change of location, a new *bracha* is not required, even

(continued on page 2)

(continued from page 1)

slaughter the calf for the purpose of eating it, R' Yehudah was nevertheless punished and received suffering for doing so." He proposes this passage as the basis for a custom to avoid inflicting pain upon animals even when doing so would benefit human beings, despite the fact that this is not technically prohibited.<sup>5</sup>

We have also previously noted<sup>6</sup> the sympathy of the Imrei Shefer (R' Eliyahu Kalatzkin) for the 19th century anti-vivisection movement:

It is also not clear that it is permitted to cause a living creature to suffer such terrible pain for the sake of examinations and experiments, and we only find that this was permitted for the sake of healing—not for the sake of examination, which is only a matter of possibility, that perhaps some benefit to medical science will emerge from it. Among the scholars of the nations there are also those who are upset and complain about the acts of cruelty that the investigators perform in their examinations of the bodies of living creatures, and they founded the Society of Anti-Vivisectionists.<sup>7</sup>

Another authority who was generally supportive of the 19<sup>th</sup>-century animal welfare movement was R' Yaakov Zev Kahana, author of Toldos Yaakov and She'eiris Yaakov, a great-nephew of the Gra:

How good and how pleasant it is that in our times, men of science and sensitivity have innovated the idea of alleviating the pain of all living creatures as much as possible, and they have established various societies to supervise this, to see to it that animals should not carry more than is appropriate for them, and if horses have dry skin infections or moist skin eruptions<sup>8</sup> or boils, they will issue an order against traveling with them until they return to their original strength. And if any of these things are found in anyone's possession, he will surely be punished, both with money and with imprisonment...They also seize the horses of the wagoners that make their living from them, to ensure that they will be careful not to do so in the future.<sup>9</sup>

Rav Kahana stresses the imperative of consideration for animal welfare and is quite critical of those who are cruel to animals:

Those men who spend their time in the sport of baiting dogs against pigs or against other animals will certainly face judgment in the future...

It therefore appears to me that it is a mitzvah incumbent upon anyone who sees oxen goring each other or chickens striking each other to separate them in such a manner that they will not come to gore or strike each other again, for this is included in the mitzvah of *prikah* (unloading) that is explained in Bava Metzia 32a...

And even with respect to minors who are accustomed to catch and to trap small animals like flies and mosquitoes, and they inflict severe pain upon them, adults are certainly obligated to separate them from this prohibition, so that they will not do such things any more (and even more so because the trait of cruelty, of not having compassion on another, becomes entrenched thereby)... It is certainly incumbent upon everyone to separate them and to protest against the children who catch flies and mosquitoes and stick straw and needles into their innards.

I remember that when I was young, I caught some *mook* (?) for sport, in the manner of children, and my father rebuked me. And I also remember that my father and master the Rav would not allow poisonous water to be placed before flies, because before they die they suffer extreme pain, so he would instead drive them out of the house, for expulsion is easier upon them than being given to drink a cup of these bitter waters.<sup>10,11</sup>

R' Avraham Meir Israel, author of Shu"t Vaya'an Avraham and *rav* in Vienna, recalled an encounter with R' Michoel Ber Weissmandl, renowned for his *hatzalah* activities during the Holocaust, for which he risked his own life:

About twenty years ago, I heard this from the mouth of the gaon and *tzadik* R' Michoel Ber Weissmandl *zt"l* of Nitra, when I met him on a train. Through the window, he showed me cows grazing in the marshland<sup>12</sup> that were running wildly to and fro—unlike the normal manner of grazers, who walk slowly, step by step. He explained to me the cause of the cows' disquiet: that it was because of their sadness that males, to which they are naturally drawn, are withheld from them, so they live with sadness and discomfort. He subsequently expressed his opinion that perhaps the reason that sadness has increased in the world in our times is because people drink the milk of anxious cows. "If it is a tradition, we accept it."<sup>13</sup>

<sup>10</sup> See Bemidbar 5:17-24.

<sup>11</sup> Toldos Yaakov ibid. p. 147.

<sup>12</sup> See Bereishis 4:2.

<sup>13</sup> Shu"t Vaya'an Avraham C.M. siman 5.

**O&A** from the  
**BAIS HAVAAD**  
**HALACHA HOTLINE**  
1.888.485.VAAD(8223)  
[ask@baishavaad.org](mailto:ask@baishavaad.org)

(continued from page 1)

if there was no intent to relocate. But *lechat'chilah* one should have *kavanah* during the *bracha* that he will move (Biur Halacha ibid. 1). Whether a relocation is minor or major depends on factors that are mostly beyond the scope of this article.



RAV ARYEH  
FINKEL

For *holchei drachim* (travelers), the rules of *shinui makom* don't apply, because their move doesn't indicate that they're finished eating—at least for someone traveling on foot. It's often different for someone traveling by car, because a vehicle is a contained area, and exiting it entails entering a new place. The halachos are as follows (Piskei Teshuvos ibid. 17, based on Shu"t Betzeil Hachochmah 6:73-74):

- If you begin your meal while driving, the rule of *holchei drachim* applies, so you can continue eating without a new *bracha* even after exiting the car and relocating.
- If you stop the car to eat, the rules of *shinui makom* apply. If you begin eating in the car and continue outdoors, the move is considered minor, and a new *bracha* is not required. But *lechat'chilah*, while you make the *bracha* you should intend to move—unless the car is within view of the new location. If you enter a building or an enclosed outdoor area, the move is major, and a new *bracha* is required even if you had *kavanah*.
- If you begin eating while the car is stationary, then you start driving and continue eating, don't make a new *bracha*; though the vehicle moves during the meal, the occupants remain in place.

For foods that require *Birkas Hamazon* or *Meiein Shalosh*, the Rama rules that *shinui makom* rules do not apply, and a new *bracha* is not required (O.C. ibid. 2). *Lechat'chilah*, though, one should recite a *bracha acharonah* before doing *shinui makom* (Rama ibid.).

(continued from page 1)



before *shkiah*, but *bedi'eved*, if *shkiah* has passed, he may still daven. He cites sources that recommend making a *tnai* (stipulation) that if it is too late for *Mincha*, the *tfilah* should

count for Ma'ariv instead, and his Ma'ariv later will serve as *tashlumin* (compensatory *tfilah*). Rav Elyashiv is cited as ruling that such a *tnai* should be made even if one davens immediately after *shkiah*, while others do not require it even when davening

long after *shkiah*.

Today, different communities' minhagim vary widely, and one's approach in this issue should depend upon the practice of his community and the ruling of his *rav*.

Scan here to receive the  
weekly email version  
of the Halacha Journal or sign up at  
[www.baishavaad.org/subscribe](http://www.baishavaad.org/subscribe)



Elevate your Inbox.

**ALLURE**  
HEALTHCARE SERVICES  
Mr. and Mrs. Michael Nudell

**BHHJ SPONSORS**

**Paula Silverman**

To become a corporate sponsor  
of the BHHJ or disseminate in  
memory/zechus of a loved one,  
email [info@baishavaad.org](mailto:info@baishavaad.org).